Book Notes: Racing to the Bottom Provincal Interdependence in the Canadian Federation, by Kathryn Harrison, (ed)

Michelle Chaisson

Follow this and additional works at: http://digitalcommons.osgoode.yorku.ca/ohlj

Book Note

Citation Information
http://digitalcommons.osgoode.yorku.ca/ohlj/vol44/iss4/10

This Book Note is brought to you for free and open access by the Journals at Osgoode Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Osgoode Hall Law Journal by an authorized editor of Osgoode Digital Commons.
United Nations Security Council. In reality, the Mackenzie King government was not willing to extend its global obligations unconditionally, and growing conflicts between the great powers marginalized the interests of the smaller states. At the San Francisco Conference, Canada adopted a cautious, moderate approach, and Chapnick argues that the country failed to emerge as a leader of the middle powers at the conference. Canadians, however, perceived themselves as an important middle power and took pride in this new status. Chapnick asserts that even though Canada’s role may have been overestimated, this should not detract from how this period impacted Canada as a nation. “Instead of assessing the significance of this period in terms of how Canada changed the world,” he states, “it is time to consider more carefully how planning a new world order changed Canada.”

In *The Middle Power Project*, Chapnick offers an important perspective in reassessing Canada’s role in the formation of the United Nations. His exhaustive use of foreign sources adds context, and his weaving in of personal accounts and correspondence demonstrates how Canadian personalities shaped the country’s foreign affairs policy during this time period.

---


**BY MICHELLE CHAISSON**

While there is no shortage of academic theorizing on the race to the bottom phenomenon in Canada, the discussion is lacking specific empirical studies. In *Racing to the Bottom*, Kathryn Harrison takes the first step in moving the debate about inter-provincial competition from

---

theory to empirical evidence. Using models and statistical evidence in discrete policy areas, each essay in this collection examines the degree to which provinces respond to each other’s policy initiatives, and, to the extent that they do, whether this results in a race to the bottom.

The most compelling case of a race to the bottom is provided by Harrison in her examination of tobacco taxation. However, as expected, Harrison finds that vulnerability to a domino effect was primarily dependent on geography. Additionally, Gerard Boychuck provides evidence of cross-provincial erosion in various indicators of social assistance provision in Canada. While there are a number of alternative explanations for this trend, Boychuck concludes that the race to the bottom hypothesis cannot simply be dismissed.

Despite these two case studies, the other essays suggest that a race to the bottom is not evident in many Canadian policy areas. Kenneth McKenzie shows that business taxes have steadily increased over the past thirty years. Doug Brown examines how inter-jurisdictional competition for economic development has proceeded in Canada by the use of incentives to attract industry.

Nancy Olewiler finds that, instead of a race to the bottom, the norm in Canadian environmental policy is harmonization interspersed with brief periods of competition for more stringent policies when public demand for pollution control spikes. David Green and Kathryn Harrison reject the hypothesis that the provinces are engaged in a race to the bottom in minimum wage policy. They conclude that the minimum wage case suggests that intergovernmental emulation or benchmarking has a significant influence on governments’ policies.

Finally, Mark Carl Rom provides a U.S. perspective to the race to the bottom debate using two policy domains: education and welfare. Rom concludes that inter-state competition in welfare is resulting in a race to the bottom, while competition in education is leading to a divergence in polices, with some states racing to the top while others race to the bottom.

In a concluding chapter, Harrison suggests that while it is reassuring that Canada is not spiralling towards the bottom in terms of taxation, environmental, and labour standards, the U.S. literature suggests that it is premature to lay to rest the prospect of a race to the bottom. The effects of inter-provincial competition may be modest and may require a more nuanced analysis.