EQUITY, RESTITUTION AND CONTRACT REMEDIES

Cases and Materials

Edited By

Peter D. Maddaugh
Associate Professor of Law
Osgoode Hall Law School

and

John D. McCamus
Associate Professor of Law
Osgoode Hall Law School

FOR STUDENT USE ONLY
NOT FOR COMMERCIAL SALE
1974–75

Graduate Programme In
Business Law
Osgoode Hall Law School
of York University
ENFORCING THE CONTRACT

A. Performance of the Contract: Recent Developments
   (i) Representations, Warranties and Conditions
   (ii) Fundamental Breach

B. The Action for Damages
   (i) The Measure of Damages
   (ii) Certainty
   (iii) Problems in Calculation
   (iv) Types of Recoverable Loss
   (v) Mitigation

C. Equitable Relief
   (i) Specific Performance
   (ii) Injunctive Relief

D. Declaratory Relief

II RESTITUTIONARY REMEDIES: AN OVERVIEW

III THE SUBSTANTIVE GROUNDS FOR RESTITUTIONARY RELIEF

A. Restitution of Benefits Conferred Under Ineffective Transactions
   (i) Informality
   (ii) Illegality
   (iii) Incapacity
   (iv) Want of Authority
   (v) Misrepresentation
   (vi) Mistake and Uncertainty
   (vii) Discharge by Breach
   (viii) Frustration
   (ix) Anticipated Contracts and Gifts

B. Recovery of the Profits of Wrongdoing
   (i) Criminal and Quasi-Criminal Acts
   (ii) Waiver of Tort
   (iii) Compulsion
   (iv) Breach of Fiduciary Duties
   (v) Unconscionable Transactions
   (vi) Other Forms of Equitable Wrongdoing
C. Restitution of Benefits Conferrd by Mistake
   (i) Mistake of Fact ................................. 665
   (ii) Mistake of Law ................................. 707
D. Unrequested Benefits and the Volunteer ................. 725
E. Compulsory Discharge of Another's Liability .......... 769

IV RESTITUTIONARY REMEDIES .................................. 791

A. Common Law Remedies ..................................... 791
   (i) Tracing Property Other Than Money ............... 791
   (ii) Tracing Money ..................................... 806
B. Equitable Remedies ....................................... 821
   (i) The Constructive Trust ........................... 821
   (ii) The Equitable Lien ................................ 865
   (iii) Tracing in Equity ................................ 887
C. Concurrent Remedies ...................................... 922
   (i) Subrogation ........................................ 922
   (ii) Contribution ...................................... 998
### Table of Contents

#### I Enforcing the Contract

##### A. Performance of the Contract: Recent Developments

1. **Representations, Warranties and Conditions.**
   - (a) Representations and Terms.
     - Neilbut, Symons & Co. v. Buckleton
     - Dick Bentley Productions Ltd. v. Smith (Motors) Ltd.
     - Leaf v. International Gallery
     - O.L.R.C. Report on Consumer Warranties & Guarantees
     - Misrepresentation Act, 1967
     - Uniform Commercial Code
     - Sealand of the Pacific Ltd. v. Ocean Cement
   - (b) Warranties and Conditions
     - Hong Kong Pir Shipping Co. Ltd. v. Kawasaki Eisen Kaisha Ltd.
     - United Dominions Trust (Commercial) Ltd. v. Eagle Aircraft Services Ltd.
     - The Mihalos Angelos
   - (c) Conditions Precedent
     - United Dominions Trust (Commercial) Ltd. v. Eagle Aircraft Services Ltd.
     - Torney & Torney v. Zhilka
     - Aldercrest Developments Ltd. v. Hunter
     - Beauchamp v. Beauchamp

2. **Fundamental Breach**
   - Suisse Atlantique Societe d'Armees Maritime S.A. v. N.V. Rotterdamse Kolen Centrale
   - Harbutt's Plantcime Ltd. v. Wayne Tank and Pump Co. Ltd.
   - R.G. McLaurv Ltd. v. Canadian Vickers Ltd.
   - R.G. Linton Constuction Ltd. v. Canadian National Railway Company
B. THE ACTION FOR DAMAGES

(1) The Measure of Damages

Puller and Perdue
The Reliance Interest in Contract Damages 125
Koufus v. C. Czarnikow Ltd.
The Heron II 137
Harbutt's Plasticene Ltd. v. Wayne Tank and Pump Co. 144
Kolan v. Solicitor 146
Sunshine Exploration Ltd. et al. v. Dolly Varden Mines Ltd. (B.P.L.) 147

(ii) Certainty

T.T.C. v. Aqua Taxi Limited et al 161
Anglia Television Ltd. v. Reed 164

(iii) Problems in Calculation

Collinane v. British "Roma" Manufacturing Co. Ltd. 166
Freedhoff v. Pomalift Industries et al. 173
R.G. McLean Ltd. v. Canadian Vickers Ltd., et al. 186
Sunnyside Greenhouses Ltd. v. Golden West Seeds Ltd. 191

(iv) Types of Recoverable Loss

Kolan v. Solicitor 199
Jarvi v. Swans Tours Ltd. 206

(v) Mitigation

Price v. The International Harvester Co. 211
Boarelli v. Flannigan 214
Harbutt's Plasticene Ltd. v. Wayne Tank and Pump Co. 225
The Queen v. Jennings and Cronshberry 226

C. EQUITABLE RELIEF

(1) Specific Performance

(a) Contracts for the Sale of Goods

Sale of Goods Act 237
Sky Petroleum Ltd. v. VIP Petroleum Ltd. 238

(b) Service Contracts

Hill v. C.A. Parsone & Co. Ltd. [1971] 241
C.H. Giles & Co. Ltd. v. Morris and Others 248
(c) Part Performance
Steadman v. Steadman ........................................ 235

(d) Damages in Lieu
Wroth and Another v. Tyler .................................. 263

(e) Specific Performance and Anticipatory Breach.

(f) Defences
Tennenbaum v. Sears ........................................... 269

(ii) Injunctions
Esso Petroleum Co. Ltd. v. Harper's Garage (Stourport) Ltd. .... 275
Stephens v. Gulf Oil Canada Ltd. et al .......................... 283

D. DECLARATORY RELIEF
Zamir, The Declaratory Judgment ............................... 290
Russian Commercial and Industrial Bank v.
British Bank for Foreign Trade United .......................... 295
Howard v. Pickford Tool Co. Ltd. ............................... 299

II RESTITUTIONARY REMEDIES: AN OVERVIEW
Goff and Jones, The Law of Restitution ......................... 305

III THE SUBSTANTIVE GROUNDS FOR RESTITUTIONARY RELIEF
A. RESTITUTION OF BENEFITS CONFERRED UNDER INEFFECTIVE TRANSACTIONS

(1) Involuntariness
Degman v. Guaranty Trust Co. ................................. 318
Sigvaldson v. Hitchen ........................................... 326
Kinzie v. Harper ................................................. 331
Morrison v. Wrights Limited ..................................... 333

(11) Illegality
(a) Enforcement of Collateral Rights
Bowmakara v. Barnett Instruments ............................. 335
Belvoir Finance Co. Ltd. v. Stapleton ........................... 341
### Exceptions to the General Rule Denying Restitution

- Kiriri Cotton Co. Ltd. v. Dewani ............................................ 347
- Kasumu and Others v. Baba Ege ............................................. 353
- Hastok v. Gyeman ............................................................... 360
- Steinberg v. Cohen .............................................................. 363
- Sidmay Ltd. et al v. Wehtam Investment Ltd. .......................... 373
- G iz v. Hauka ........................................................................ 384
- Rigos v. Boustead ................................................................. 387

#### Incapacity

##### (iii) Incapacity

- **Ultra Vires Contracts**
  - Trades Hall Co. v. Erie Tobacco Co. ...................................... 393
  - Caledonia Commercial Credit Union v. Haldimand Feed Mill Ltd. 407

- **Mental Incompetence**
  - Re Rhodes ........................................................................ 410

- **Infancy**
  - K. Leslie Limited v. Sheil .................................................. 415

##### (iv) Want of Authority

- Craven-Ellis v. Canons Ltd. .................................................... 429
- Hazlewood et al v. West Coast Securities Ltd. .......................... 433

##### (v) Misrepresentation

- **Executed Contracts**
  - Leaf v. International Gallery, supra ...................................... 11
  - Bevan v. Anderson et al ..................................................... 440

- **Consequential Relief: Indemnity**
  - Wiley et al v. Fortin et al .................................................. 459

##### (vi) Mistake and Uncertainty

- **Mistake**
  - Bolton v. Jones .................................................................. 455
  - Cooper v. Phillips ............................................................... 457
  - Solie v. Butcher .................................................................. 462

- **Uncertainty**
  - Estok v. Neguy .................................................................... 468
(vii) Discharge by Breach
(a) The Right of the Innocent Party
Hunt v. Silk ........................................ 472
Planche v. Colburn ................................. 474
(b) The Rights of the Party in Breach
Sumpter v. Wednes .................................. 475
Fairbanks Soap v. Sheppard ....................... 477
Stocklosser v. Johnson ............................. 481

(viii) Frustration
The Frustrated Contracts Act, R.S.O. 1970, c.185 .... 485
The Frustrated Contracts Act, S.B.C. 1974, c.37 .... 487

(ix) Anticipated Contracts and Gifts
(a) Contracts
Brewer Street Investments v. Barclays Woollen ... 489
(b) Gifts
Rowe v. Public Trustee ............................. 496

B. RECOVERY OF THE PROFITS OF WRONGDOING
(1) Criminal and Quasi-Criminal Acts
Note ................................................. 502
(11) Waiver of Tort
Note .................................................. 503
(a) The Election Problem
United Australia Ltd. v. Barclays Bank Ltd. .... 504
(b) The Scope of the Doctrine
Phillips v. Nonfrey ................................. 531
(c) The Measure of Recovery
O'Neill v. Nye & Nisson Co. ....................... 543
Townsvie Properties Ltd. v. Sun Construction
and Equipment Ltd. .............................. 547
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>(iii) Compulsion</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(a) Duress</td>
<td>Note</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Practical Compulsion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knutson v. Bourke's Syndicate et al</td>
<td>555</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peter Kiewit Sons Co. of Canada Ltd v. Eakin's Construction Ltd</td>
<td>559</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morton Construction Co. Ltd v. City of Hamilton</td>
<td>567</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>George (Porky) Jacob Enterprises Ltd v. City of Regina</td>
<td>573</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reid v. Township of Brantford</td>
<td>576</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) Undue Influence</td>
<td>Note</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(iv) Breach of Fiduciary Duties</td>
<td>Note</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Establishing a Fiduciary Relationship</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Midco Oil and Gas Ltd v. New British Dominion Oil Co. Ltd. and Brook</td>
<td>588</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jirna Ltd v. Mister Donut of Canada Ltd</td>
<td>603</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fre-Cam Exploration &amp; Development Ltd v. McTavish</td>
<td>614</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) The Duty of Loyalty</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McLeod and Moore v. Sweeney</td>
<td>618</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) Breach of the Duty of Loyalty</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading v. Attorney-General</td>
<td>623</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canadian Aero Service Ltd v. O'Malley</td>
<td>627</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(d) Liability for Breach of the Duty of Loyalty</td>
<td>Note</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(v) Unconscionable Transactions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Note</td>
<td>644</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waters v. Donnelly</td>
<td>644</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guerin v. Plastic Dance Studios Ltd</td>
<td>650</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morrison v. Coast Finance Ltd</td>
<td>653</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(vi) Other Forms of Equitable Wrongdoing</td>
<td>Note</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
C. RESTITUTION OF BENEFITS CONFERRED UNDER MISTAKE

(i) Mistake of Fact

Royal Bank of Canada v. The King .................................................. 665

(a) An Honest Mistake

Kelly v. Solari ................................................................. 671
Clark v. Eckroyd ............................................................. 674

(b) Between the Parties

Note ................................................................. 679

(c) A Supposed Obligation to Pay

Note ................................................................. 679

(d) No Equity in the Defendant to Retain the Payment

Krebs v. World Finance Co. Ltd. ........................................ 680
R.E. Jones Ltd. v. Waring & Gillow Ltd. .......................... 684
Purity Dairy Ltd. .......................................................... 695

(ii) Mistake of Law

O'Grady v. City of Toronto ................................................. 707

(a) Distinguish between Mistakes of Law and Fact

Eaglesfield v. Marquis of Londonderry ............................. 709
Naccarlane and Wellington Hotel .................................. 710
George (Porky) Jacobs Enterprises Ltd. v. City of Regina ...... 713

(b) Exceptions to the Rule in Equity

Note ................................................................. 714
Kadie v. Township of Brantford ...................................... 715
Koddy v. Power .......................................................... 716
Rogers v. Ingham .......................................................... 719

D. UNREQUESTED BENEFITS AND THE VOLUNTEER

Felton v. Finley ............................................................. 725

(a) The Officious Intermeddler

Norton v. Heggitt .......................................................... 731
Falke v. Scottish Imperial Insurance Co. ......................... 733

(b) Agency of Necessity

Hastings v. Village of Semans ....................................... 745
(c) Preservation of Life
Matheson v. Smiley ........................................ 750
Attorney-General for British Columbia v.
Parklands Private Hospital Ltd. ....... 754

(d) Preservation of Property
Nicholson v. Chapman ...................................... 761
Sherrin v. Haggerty ........................................ 763
In re Piko ...................................................... 767

E. COMPULSORY DISCHARGE OF ANOTHER'S LIABILITY
Moule v. Garrett ............................................ 769
Whitham v. Bullock ......................................... 770
Brook's Wharf and Bull Wharf Ltd. v. Goodman Bros. .... 774
General Security Insurance Co. of Canada v.
Howard Sand & Gravel Co. Ltd. .............. 779
Lambert Implements Ltd. v. Pardell .............. 786

IV. RESTITUTIONARY REMEDIES

A. COMMON LAW REMEDIES

Note ......................................................... 791

(i) Tracing Property other than Money
(a) Accessio
  Firestone Tire & Rubber Co. of
  Canada Ltd. v. Industrial Acceptance
  Corp. Ltd. ........................................... 792
  Jones v. De Marchant .................................. 795

(b) Confusio and Commixio
  Lawrie v. Rathbun .................................... 799

(c) Specificatio
  Silsbury and Calkins v. McCoen
  and Sherman ......................................... 803
(11) Tracing Money

Note .................................................. 806

Taylor v. Plummer ..................................... 807
Banque Belge pour L’Etranger v. Habrouck .............. 811

B. EQUITABLE REMEDIES

(1) The Constructive Trust

Note .................................................. 821

(a) Those Arising out of Express Trusts
   Anckorn v. Stewart .............................. 823

(b) Those Arising out of Other Fiduciary Relationships
   Banque Romande v. Mercantile Bank of Canada .... 827

(c) Those Arising out of Fraud
   McCormick v. Grogan ............................ 837
   Pahara et al. v. Pahara .......................... 838

(d) The Constructive Trust as a General Remedy
   Craddock Bros. v. Hunt .......................... 842
   Hussey v. Palmer ................................. 847
   Murdock v. Murdock ............................. 851

(11) The Equitable-Lien

Note .................................................. 865

Montreuil v. Ontario Asphalt Co. ....................... 865
Gleavesky v. Stachnik ................................ 877
Dickman v. Dickman .................................. 882
### (iii) Tracing in Equity

**Note**

- **(a) When does the Right to Trace in Equity Arise?**
  - Re Hallett's Estate
  - Sinclair v. Broughan
  - Nebraska National Bank v. Johnson
  - Deeks-LaFarge Ltd. v. Milne et al.
  - Roblin v. Jackson
  - Goodbody et al. v. Bank of Montreal
  - Merchants Express Co. v. Morton
  - Re Blackhawk Downs Inc. and Arnold et al.

- **(b) When will the Right to Trace in Equity be Lost?**
  - The Rule in Clayton's Case
  - The Rule in Hallett's Case
  - The Rule in Re Gateway
  - The 'Lowest Intermediate Balance' Rule
  - The Available Remedies
  - Competing Beneficial Owners
  - The Innocent Volunteer

### C. CONCURRENT REMEDIES

**(i) Subrogation**

**Note**

- **(a) Subrogation of the Plaintiff to the Rights of the Payee Against a Third Party**
  - Weldon v. Canadian Surety Co.
  - Bayda v. Canada North Dakota Land Co. Ltd. et al.
  - Re Okotoks Milling Co. Ltd.
  - Traders Realty Ltd. v. Huron Heights Shopping Plaza Ltd.

- **(b) Subrogation of the Plaintiff to the Rights of a Third Party against the Payee**
  - Bank of Nova Scotia v. Kelly
  - Brown v. McLean
  - Congressbury Motors Ltd. v. Anglo-Belge Finance Co. Ltd.
  - Reversion Fund and Insurance Co. Ltd. v. Maison Cosway, Ltd.

- **(c) The "Officious" Subrogee**
  - Campbell Auto Finance Co. v. Warren
  - Re Cleadon Trust Ltd.
(ii) Contribution

Whitham v. Bullock ........................................ 998
Brook's Wharf and Bull Wharf Ltd. v. Goodman Bros... 998
Continental Insurance Co. v. Prudential Insurance
Co. Ltd. of England ........................................ 998