

Cases and Materials on Restitution

Edited by

John D. McCamus
Osgoode Hall Law School
York University

1998-99 Edition

VOLUME ONE

WINTER TERM
FOR USE IN SCHOOL YEAR 1998-99
COURSE NUMBER 2360

FOR STUDENT USE ONLY
NOT FOR COMMERCIAL SALE
1998-99

MATERIALS DISTRIBUTION CENTRE
OSGOODE HALL LAW SCHOOL

Cases and Materials on Restitution

Volume One

Table of Contents

Part I Introductory Materials

Introduction.....	1
Samek, Unjust Enrichment, etc.....	2
Restatement of Restitution.....	4
Moses v. McFerlan.....	13
Sinclair v. Brougham.....	17
Deglman v. Guaranty Trust.....	25
Saint John Tugboat v. Irving Refinery.....	29
Pettkus v. Becker.....	32

Part II THE SUBSTANTIVE GROUNDS FOR RESTITUTIONARY RELIEF

1. RESTITUTION OF BENEFITS CONFERRED UNDER MISTAKE

A. Mistake of Fact

Royal Bank of Canada v. The King.....	49
---------------------------------------	----

(a) An Honest Mistake

Kelly v. Solari.....	55
Clark v. Eckroyd.....	57

(b) Between the Parties

Note.....	61
-----------	----

(c) A Supposed Obligation to Pay

Larner v. London Count Council.....	61
Lady Hood of Avalon v. MacKinnon...	63

(d) No Equity in the Defendant to Retain Payment

Krebs v. World of Finance Co. Ltd..	67
R.E. Jones v. Waring & Gillow Ltd..	71
Rural Municipality of Storthoaks v.	
Mobil Oil Canada Ltd.....	82

(e) A Restatement

Barclays Bank v. W.J. Simms Son and	
-------------------------------------	--

Cooke Ltd.....	94
----------------	----

B. Mistake of Law

(a) The General Rule

Bilbie v. Lumley and Others.....	105
O'Grady v. City of Toronto.....	106

(b) Distinguishing Between Mistakes of Law and Fact

Eaglesfield v. Marquis of Londonderry.	108
Macfarlane and Wellington Hotel v. Kennedy.....	109
George (Porky) Jacobs Enterprises Ltd. v. City of Regina.....	113

(c) Exceptions to the Rule in Equity

Note.....	115
Eadie v. Township of Brantford.....	116
Keddy v. Power.....	122

(d) A Restatement?

Hydro-Electric Commission of Nepean v. Ontario Hydro.....	126
---	-----

C. Recovery of Other Benefits Conferred Under Mistake

(i) <u>Improvements to Land</u> Montreuil v. Ontario Asphalt Co....	146
--	-----

(ii) <u>Improvements to Chattels</u> Greenwood v. Bennett et al.....	163
---	-----

(iii) <u>Discharge of a secured interest</u> Re <i>Central Guaranty Trust v. Dixdale</i>	166a
---	------

2. RESTITUTION OF BENEFITS CONFERRED UNDER INEFFECTIVE TRANSACTIONS

(i) Informality

Deglman v. Guaranty Trust Co.....	25
Sigvaldson v. Hitsman.....	169

(ii) Illegality

Note.....	172
-----------	-----

iv.		
(a)	<u>The Enforceability Issue</u>	
	St. John Shipping v. Rank.....	173
(b)	<u>Enforcement of Collateral Rights</u>	
	Bowmakers v. Barnet Instruments.....	173K
	Belvoir Finance v. Stapleton.....	178
(c)	<u>Exceptions to the General Rule Denying Restitution</u>	
	Kiriri Cotton Co. Ltd. v. Dewani.....	184
	Hasiuk v. Oshaneck.....	190
	Steinberg v. Cohen.....	193
	Maddaugh & McCamus.....	203(a)
	Kasumu and Others v. Baba-Egbe.....	204
	Sidmay Ltd. et al. v. Whettam Investments Ltd.....	211
	Ciz v. Hauka.....	222
	Berne Developments Ltd. v. Haviland et al.....	225
	Bigos v. Boustead.....	237
(d)	<u>The Rise and Fall of Subrogation</u>	
	Congresbury Motors v. Anglo-Belge Finance.....	244
	Orakpo v. Manson Investments.....	248
(iii)	<u>Incapacity</u>	
(a)	<u>Ultra Vires Contracts</u>	
	Note.....	254
	Trades Hall Co. v. Erie Tobacco Co.	256
	Breckenridge Speedway et al. v. The Queen.....	270
	Westdeutsche v. Islington L.B.C.	289a
(b)	<u>Mental Incompetence</u>	
	Note.....	290
(c)	<u>Minors' Contracts</u>	
	Note.....	291
	R. Leslie Limited v. Sheill.....	294
	Murray v. Dean.....	302
	Bo-Lassen v. Josiassen.....	303
(iv)	<u>Want of Authority</u>	
	Craven-Ellis v. Canons Ltd.....	308
	Hazlewood et al. v. West Coast Securities Ltd.....	312

	v	
(v)	<u>Misrepresentation</u>	
(a)	<u>Executed Contracts</u>	
	Leaf v. International Galleries....	320
	Bevan v. Anderson et al.....	324
	Misrepresentation Act (U.K.).....	332
	The Business Practices Act (Ont.)..	333
(b)	<u>Consequential Relief, Indemnity</u>	
	Wiley et al. v. Fortin et al.....	338
(vi)	<u>Mistake and Uncertainty</u>	
(a)	<u>Mistake</u>	
	Note.....	342
	Boulton v. Jones.....	343
	Cooper v. Phibbs.....	345
	Solle v. Butcher.....	350
	McCarthy Milling Co. Ltd v. Elder Packing Co. Ltd.....	357
	James More & Sons v. University of Ottawa.....	362
(b)	<u>Uncertainty</u>	
	Estok v. Heguy.....	372
(vii)	<u>Discharge by Breach</u>	
(a)	<u>The Rights of the Innocent Party</u>	
	Hunt v. Silk.....	376
	Planche v. Colburn and Another....	379
(b)	<u>The Rights of the Party in Breach</u>	
	Sumpter v. Hedges.....	380
	Fairbanks Soap Co. Ltd. v. Sheppard	382
	Stockloser v. Johnson.....	386
	A.G. v. Blake.....	379a
(viii)	<u>Frustration</u>	
	The Frustrated Contracts Act (Ont.)	390
	The Frustrated Contracts Act (B.C.)	393
	Parsons v. Shea.....	396
	Angus v. Scully.....	401
(ix)	<u>Anticipated Contracts and Gifts</u>	

(a)	<u>Contracts</u>	
	Brewer Street Investments v. Barclays Woollen.....	402
(b)	<u>Gifts</u>	
	Rowe v. Public Trustee.....	409