Cases and Materials on Restitution

Edited by

John D. McCamus
Associate Professor of Law
Osgoode Hall Law School

and

Peter D. Maddaugh
of the Ontario Bar

1981-02 Edition

FOR STUDENT USE ONLY
NOT FOR COMMERCIAL SALE
1981-82

Osgoode Hall Law School
of York University
Cases and Materials on Restitution

Table of Contents

PART I Introductory Materials

| Introduction | 1 |
| Samek, Unjust Enrichment, etc. | 2 |
| Restatement of Restitution | 4 |
| Moses v. McFarlan | 13 |
| Sinclair v. Brougham | 17 |
| Deglman v. Guaranty Trust Co. | 31 |
| Saint John Tugboat v. Irving Refinery | 39 |
| Pettis v. Becker | 42 |

PART II THE SUBSTANTIVE GROUNDS FOR RESTITUTIONARY RELIEF

1. RESTITUTION OF BENEFITS CONFERRED UNDER MISTAKE

A. Mistake of Fact

| Royal Bank of Canada v. The King | 69 |
| (a) An Honest Mistake | |
| Kelly v. Solari | 65 |
| Clark v. Eckroyd | 68 |
| (b) Between the Parties | |
| Note | 73 |
| (c) A Supposed Obligation to Pay | |
| Larner v. London County Council | 73 |
| Lady Hood of Avalon v. Mackinnon | 75 |
| (d) No Equity in the Defendant to Retain Payment | |
| Krebs v. World Finance Co. Ltd. | 79 |
| R.E. Jones v. Waring & Gillow Ltd. | 83 |
| Deutsche Bank v. Berlino | 94 |
| United Overseas Bank v. Jlwani | 96 |
| Rural Municipality of Storthoaks v. Mobil Oil Canada Ltd. | 98 |

B. Mistake of Law

| O'Grady v. City of Toronto | 122 |
| (a) Distinguishing Between Mistakes of Law and Fact | |
| Eaglesfield v. Marquis of Londonderry | 124 |
| Macfarlane and Wellington Hotel v. Kennedy | 125 |
| George (Porky) Jacobs Enterprises Ltd. v. City of Regina | 129 |
| (b) Exceptions to the Rule in Equity | |
| Note | 131 |
| Eadic v. Township of Brantford | 132 |
| Keddy v. Power | 138 |
| Rogers v. Ingham | 141 |

C. Recovery of Other Benefits Conferred Under Mistake

| (i) Recovery of Land Conveyed | |
| Devald & Devald v. Zigeuner & Zigeuner | 147 |
| Riverlate Properties v. Paul | 150 |
| (ii) Improvements to Land and Chattels | |
| Greenwood v. Bennett et al. | 159 |

2. RESTITUTION OF BENEFITS CONFERRED UNDER INEFFECTIVE TRANSACTIONS

| (i) Informality | |
| Deglman v. Guaranty Trust Co. | 31 |
| Sigvaldson v. Hitzman | 165 |
| Kinzie v. Harper | 168 |
| Harrison v. Wrights Limited | 170 |
| (ii) Illegality | |
| Note | 171 |
(v)

(a) Enforcement of Collateral Rights
Bowmakers v. Burnet Instruments ........................................... 172
Belvoir Finance v. Stapleton .................................................. 175

(b) Exceptions to the General Rule Denying Restitution
Kiriri Cotton Co. Ltd. v. Dewani ........................................... 184
Kasumu and Others v. Baba-Egbe ............................................ 190
Haslik v. Oshaneke .............................................................. 197
Steinberg v. Cohen .............................................................. 200
Sidmay Ltd. et al. v. Wehtam Investments Ltd. ......................... 210
Ciz v. Haika ........................................................................... 221
Bigos v. Boustead ................................................................. 225

(c) The Rise and Fall of Subrogation
Congresbury Motors v. Anglo-Belge Finance ............................. 232
Orakpo v. Manson Investments ................................................ 236

(iii) Incapacity
(a) Ultra Vires Contracts
Note ......................................................................................... 242
Trades Hall Co. v. Erie Tobacco Co. .......................................... 244
Breckenridge Speedway et al. v. The Queen ............................... 258

(b) Mental Incompetence
Note ......................................................................................... 278
Wilson v. The King .................................................................... 279

(c) Minors' Contracts
Note ......................................................................................... 299
R. Leslie Limited v. Shill ......................................................... 302
Murray v. Dean .......................................................................... 315
Bo-Lassen v. Jøslassen ............................................................. 317

(iv) Want of Authority
Craven-Ellis v. Canons Ltd. ...................................................... 322
Hazelwood et al. v. West Coast Securities Ltd. ......................... 326

(v) Misrepresentation
(a) Executed Contracts
Leaf v. International Galleries .................................................. 334
Bevan v. Anderson et al. ......................................................... 338
Misrepresentation Act (U.K.) .................................................. 348
The Business Practices Act (Ont.) .......................................... 349

(b) Consequential Relief, Indemnity
Wiley et al. v. Fortin et al. ....................................................... 354

(vi) Mistake and Uncertainty
(a) Mistake
Note ......................................................................................... 358
Boulton v. Jones ........................................................................ 359
Cooper v. Phibbs ....................................................................... 361
Solle v. Butcher ........................................................................ 366
McCarthy Milling Co. Ltd. v. Elder Packing Co. Ltd. .................. 373
James More & Sons Ltd. v. University of Ottawa ....................... 378

(b) Uncertainty
Estok v. Heguy ........................................................................... 389

(vii) Discharge by Breach
(a) The Rights of the Innocent Party
Hunt v. Silk ................................................................................ 393
Planche v. Colburn and Another ................................................ 396

(b) The Rights of the Party in Breach
Sumpter v. Hedges ..................................................................... 397
Fairbanks Soap Co. Ltd. v. Sheppard ......................................... 399
Stockloser v. Johnson ............................................................... 403

(viii) Frustration
The Frustrated Contracts Act (Ont.) ........................................ 408
The Frustrated Contracts Act (B.C.) ........................................ 410
Parsons v. Shea .......................................................................... 413
Angus v. Scully .......................................................................... 418
B.P. Exploration Co. v. Hunt (No. 2) ......................................... 419

(ix) Anticipated Contracts and Gifts
(a) Contracts
Brewer Street Investments v. Barclays Woollen ....................... 460

(b) Gifts
Rowe v. Public Trustee ............................................................. 467
3. RECOVERY OF THE PROFITS OF WRONGDOING

(i) Criminal and Quasi-Criminal Acts

Note ........................................... 473
Re Johnson .................................... 474
Schobert v. Barber .......................... 481
Gray v. Barr ................................. 486

(ii) Waiver of Tort

Note ........................................... 493

(a) The Election Problem

United Australia Ltd. v. Barclays Bank Ltd. 494
Mahesan v. Malaysian Gov't Housing Society 521

(b) The Scope of the Doctrine

Phillips v. Homfrey .......................... 528
Daniel v. O'Leary ............................ 540

(c) The Measure of Recovery

Olwell v. Rye & Nisson Co. ............... 542

(iii) Compulsion

(a) Duress

Note ........................................... 546
Skeate v. Beale ................................ 548
Fuller v. Stoltze ............................. 552

(b) Practical Compulsion

Knutson v. Bourkes Syndicate ............ 566
Peter Kiewet Sons Co. of Canada Ltd. et al. v. Eakins Construction Ltd. 570
The 'Sibooen' and the 'Sibotre' .......... 579
North Ocean Shipping v. Hyundai ......... 582
Pao On et al. v. Lan Yiu et al. .......... 592
Horton Construction v. City of Hamilton . 601
George (Porky) Jacobs Enterprises Ltd. v. City of Regina ...... 607
Eadie v. Township of Brantford ........... 608

(c) Undue Influence

Note ........................................... 613
McKenzie v. Bank of Montreal et al. .... 616

(iv) Breach of Fiduciary Duties

Note ........................................... 625

(a) Establishing a Fiduciary Relationship

Midcon Oil and Gas Ltd. v. New British Dominion Oil Co. Ltd. ............. 626
Jirna Ltd. v. Mister Donut of Canada Ltd. 642
Pre-Cam Exploration & Development Ltd. et al. v. McTavish et al. ........... 653

(b) The Duty of Loyalty

McLeod and More v. Sweezy ............... 657

(c) Breach of the Duty of Loyalty

Reading v. Attorney-General .............. 662
Peso Silver Mines Ltd. v. Cropper ......... 666
Canadian Aero Services Ltd. v. O'Malley ...... 692

(d) Liability for Breach of the Duty of Loyalty

Note ........................................... 707

(v) Unconscionable Transactions

Waters v. Donnelly .......................... 709
Gaertner v. Fiesta Dance Studios ......... 715
Clifford Davis Management Ltd. v. WEA Records Ltd. 718
Morrison v. Coast Finance Ltd. ........... 721

(vi) Other Forms of Equitable Wrongdoing

Unsworth v. Grant .......................... 726

(a) Hiding Behind The Statute of Frauds

Note ........................................... 735

(b) Dishonoured Undertakings: Interests in Land

Note ........................................... 737
Binions v. Evans ............................ 738
(ix)

(c) Dishonoured Undertakings: Restrictive Covenants

Note ........................................ 742
Canadian Brotherhood of Railway and General
Workers v. B.C. Airlines Ltd. ........................ 744

(d) Abuse of Confidence

Saltman Engineering Co. Ltd. v. Campbell
Engineering Co. Ltd. ................................ 756

(e) Refusal to Share Spousal Assets on Separation

Rathwell v. Rathwell ................................ 759
Pettkus v. Becker .................................. 46

4. COMPULSORY DISCHARGE OF ANOTHER'S LIABILITY

Moule v. Garrett .................................. 777
D & J Motors Ltd. v. Ellis .......................... 778
Brooks Wharf and Bull Wharf Ltd. v. Goodman Bros 782
County of Carleton v. City of Ottawa .................. 786
General Security Ins. Co. of Canada v.
Howard Sand & Gravel Co. Ltd. ......................... 792
Lambert Implements Ltd. v. Pardell et al. .............. 799

5. UNREQUESTED BENEFITS AND THE VOLUNTEER

Felton v. Finley .................................... 804
Nicholson v. St. Denis et al. ........................ 810
Mechanical Contractors Association of Ottawa
v. J.J. Rivard Ltd. .................................. 814

(a) The Officious Intermeddler

Norton v. Haggett .................................. 819
Falcke v. Scottish Imperial Insurance Co. ............. 823
Owen v. Tate et al. .................................... 831

(b) Agency of Necessity

Hastings v. Village of Semans ........................ 839

(c) Preservation of Life

Matheson v. Smiley ................................ 841
Attorney-General for British Columbia
v. Parklane Private Hospital Ltd. ...................... 843

(d) Preservation of Property

Nicholson v. Chapman .............................. 856
Sherrin v. Haggerty .................................. 890
In re Pike .......................................... 893

(x)

6. Restitutionary Liability of Public Authorities

William Whitely Ltd. v. R. ........................ 863
Mason v. New South Wales .......................... 866
Hydro Electric Commission of the Township of
Nepean v. Ontario Hydro ............................ 874
Amax Potash Ltd. v. Govt. of Saskatchewan ........... 886

PART III RESTITUTIONARY REMEDIES

A. COMMON LAW REMEDIES

(i) Tracing Property other than Money

(a) Accessio

Firestone Tire & Rubber Co. of Canada Ltd.
v. Industrial Acceptance Corp. Ltd. ............... 908
Jones v. De Marchant ............................... 911

(b) Confusio and Commixtio

Lawrie v. Rathbun .................................. 915

(c) Specificatio

Silbury and Calkins v. McCoon and Sherman ........ 919

(ii) Tracing Money

Note .................................................. 922
Taylor v. Plumer .................................... 923
Banque Belgue pour l'Etranger v. Hambrouck ....... 927

B. EQUITABLE REMEDIES

(i) The Constructive Trust

Note .................................................. 937

(a) Those Arising out of Express Trusts

Ankcorn v. Stewart ................................ 939

(b) Those Arising out of Other Fiduciary
Relationships

Note .................................................. 942

(c) Those Arising out of Fraud

McCormick v. Grogan ................................ 944
Pahara et al. v. Pahara .............................. 945
(d) The Constructive Trust as a General Remedy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case Study</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Craddock Bros. v. Hunt</td>
<td>949</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hussey v. Palmer</td>
<td>955</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rathwell v. Rathwell</td>
<td>759</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pettkus v. Becker</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chase Manhattan Bank v. Israel-British Bank</td>
<td>969</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(ii) The Equitable Lien

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case Study</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Montreuil v. Ontario Asphalt Co.</td>
<td>969</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(iii) Tracing in Equity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case Study</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(a) When does the Right to Trace in Equity Arise?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Re Hallett's Estate</td>
<td>983</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sinclair v. Brougham</td>
<td>984</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nebraska National Bank v. Johnson</td>
<td>985</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chase Manhattan Bank v. Israel-British Bank</td>
<td>989</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) When will the Right to Trace in Equity be Lost?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Rule in Clayton's Case</td>
<td>988</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Rule in Hallett's Case</td>
<td>988</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Rule in Re Oatway</td>
<td>990</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The 'Lowest Intermediate Balance' Rule</td>
<td>990</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Available Remedies</td>
<td>992</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competing Beneficial Owners</td>
<td>993</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Innocent Volunteer</td>
<td>994</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

C. CONCURRENT REMEDIES

(1) Subrogation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case Study</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(a) Subrogation of the Plaintiff to the Rights of the Payee Against a Third Party</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weldon v. Canadian Surety Co.</td>
<td>998</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bayda v. Canada North Dakota Land Co. Ltd.</td>
<td>1010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>et al.</td>
<td>1010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Re Okotoks Milling Co. Ltd.</td>
<td>1012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brown v. McLean</td>
<td>1013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traders Realty Ltd. v. Huron Heights Shopping Plaza Ltd.</td>
<td>1017</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>